

Forest Heath District Council

**DEVELOPMENT
CONTROL COMMITTEE**

5 AUGUST 2015

DEV/FH/15/029

Report of the Head of Planning and Growth

**PLANNING APPLICATION DC/15/0856/FUL – PHILLIPS FARM, WILDE
STREET, BECK ROW**

Synopsis:

Application under the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and associated matters.

Recommendation:

It is recommended that the Committee determine the attached application and associated matters.

CONTACT OFFICER

Case Officer: Sarah Drane
Telephone: 01638 719432

Committee Report

Date 08.05.15 **Expiry Date:** 03.07.15

Registered:

Case Sarah Drane **Recommendation:** Refuse

Officer:

Parish: Beck Row **Ward:** Eriswell and The Rows

Proposal: Planning Application DC/15/0856/FUL - Demolition of existing bungalow. Construction of new two storey detached 5 bedroom dwelling and detached Cart Barn (Resubmission of DC/14/1313/FUL)

Site: Phillips Farm, Wilde Street, Beck Row

Applicant: Mrs Emma Eagle

Background:

This application is referred to the Development Control Committee following consideration by the Delegation Panel.

The Parish Council have raised no objections, but the application is recommended for refusal.

Proposal:

1. Planning permission is sought for a two-storey 5 bedroom house to replace an existing small bungalow. The house has a two storey footprint of 12.6m x 7m, with small single storey additions to the front and side. The gross internal floor area is 174.6 sq m. The height to the ridge is approx. 8.3m. The elevations also show solar panels on the rear facing roof slope and bat boxes on the rear and side elevations.
2. The application also includes the construction of an outbuilding to accommodate office, store, 2 parking spaces and a kennel. This building has a footprint of 14.2m x 5.5m and a ridge height of 3.8m, constructed of black stained weatherboarding under pantile or plain tile roof. Access into the site would remain as existing. Landscaping proposals are also indicated.
3. An amended red line plan has been provided reducing the size of the application site so that it only defines the curtilage to the replacement dwelling.

Application Supporting Material:

4. Information submitted with both applications as follows:
 - Design and Access Statement
 - Initial Assessment Bat, Barn Owl and Breeding Bird Survey
 - Bat survey report (greenlight Environmental Consultancy)
 - Land contamination questionnaire
 - EnviroSearch
 - Location plan
 - Existing plans
 - Proposed plans

Site Details:

5. The single storey dwelling is accessed from an unmade track from Wilde Street, along Breach Drove. The existing L-shaped bungalow is 3.2m to the ridge, 2.5m to the eaves, 12.6m long and 10.5m at its widest point and is situated in the south-west corner of this substantial site. A replacement barn (9m(l) x 7m(w) x 3.68m(h)) with green steel cladding and a green roof has recently been approved and constructed to the east of the dwelling. There are other structures in the vicinity of the barn, including an existing shed, a caravan/mobile home and a pig sty.
6. The dwelling is situated in an isolated location in the countryside. Dwellings nearest to the application site are Stanley Farm approx. 50m to the south and The Pines approx. 65m to the south east, both are accessed from the same unmade track. Dwellings to the rear of the proposed development (110m south-west) consist of a one-and-a-half storey dwelling (Upton Park Manor) and a bungalow 200m to the east on Wilde Street.

Planning History:

7. **F/93/563:** Demolition of existing dwelling and replacement with single storey dwelling. Approved

F/99/022: Renewal of permission to demolish existing dwelling and erect replacement single storey dwelling. Approved

F/2004/0157/FUL: Demolition of existing dwelling and erection of a replacement single storey dwelling. Withdrawn

F/2011/0340/HOU: Erection of barn (demolition of existing barn). Approved

DC/14/1313/FUL: Planning Application - Demolition of existing bungalow. Construction of new two storey detached 5 bedroom dwelling and detached Cart Barn. Withdrawn

DC/15/0904/FUL: Planning Application - Demolition of existing bungalow. Construction of new 1 ½ storey detached 5 bedroom dwelling

and detached Cart Barn - Approved

Consultations:

8. Public Health And Housing: No objection, subject to conditions

Environmental Health: No objection

Mildenhall Internal Drainage Board: provide comments – discharge of surface water overflow into the drain will require consent

Suffolk Wildlife Trust: further surveys required

Environment Agency: No objection

SCC Highways: No objection

Ecology Tree And Landscape Officer: No objection subject to a condition to secure a bat mitigation strategy

Representations:

9. Parish Council: support

10. Ward Member: Cllr Bowman requested the application be considered by the Development Control Committee.

Policy: The following policies of the Forest Heath Development Plan have been taken into account in the consideration of this application:

11. Forest Heath Core Strategy (2010):

- CS1 Spatial Strategy
- CS3 Landscape Character and the historic environment
- CS5 Design quality and local distinctiveness
- CS10 Sustainable Rural Communities

12. Joint Development Management Policies Document (2015):

- DM1 Presumption in favour of sustainable development
- DM2 Creating Places – Development principles and local distinctiveness
- DM5 Development in the Countryside
- DM11 Protected Species
- DM12 Mitigation, Enhancement, Management and Monitoring of Biodiversity
- DM22 Residential Design

Other Planning Policy:

13. National Planning Policy Framework (2012):

- Core principles
- Section 6: Delivering a wide choice of high quality homes
- Section 7: Requiring good design
- Section 11: Conserving and enhancing the natural environment

Officer Comment:

14. The issues to be considered in the determination of the application are:

- Principle of Development
- Impact on Countryside
- Impact on Protected Species

Principle of Development

15. The dwelling proposed to be replaced is a single storey dwelling with a footprint of approx. 92sqm, 3.2m to the ridge and 2.5m to the eaves. The two storey dwelling measures 8.3m in height (5.15m to the eaves). A substantial outbuilding, 14.2m long by 5.5m deep and 3.8m to the ridge, to accommodate an office, store, 2 parking spaces and a kennel is also proposed. The site layout includes some proposed new planting to the south and west to screen the property.

16. Policy DM5 seeks to prevent replacement dwellings which are disproportionate in size and scale to the original dwelling; that are excessive in scale and massing and thereby more physically and visually intrusive than the existing smaller dwelling. A replacement dwelling, when clearly disproportionate to the original, would be tantamount in its impact to new development in the countryside. Even where a site is well screened there is a wider concern to maintain the intrinsic rural character and qualities of the countryside. The principle of a replacement dwelling on the site is acceptable, subject to the scale and floor area respecting that of the existing dwelling. This has been demonstrated through the grant of planning permission for a replacement 1 ½ storey dwelling (see planning history above).

Impact on Countryside

17. The site lies in the open countryside north of the village of Beck Row, about 1km when measured in a straight line or 1.3km measured along the road, beyond the development boundary. The site is located at the end of a shared, unmade track (known as Breach Drove) from Wilde Street within substantial land to the north. The site is mainly screened from public views but can be glimpsed from Wilde Street.

18. The proposed two-storey replacement dwelling would be more than double the floor area and scale of the existing dwelling and therefore fails to respect the scale of the dwelling it seeks to replace. It is considered that this is contrary to policy DM5 which only permits replacement dwellings on a one for one basis where it can be demonstrated that the proposed replacement dwelling respects the scale and floor area of the existing dwelling, and in accordance with other DM policies.

19. At pre-application stage before the submission of the previously withdrawn application DC/14/1313/FUL, the agent was advised of the officer's policy concerns in writing and during a subsequent meeting with the applicant further discussions were held. Officers confirmed that a replacement dwelling was acceptable in principle and suggested to reduce the scale of the proposed replacement dwelling to better respect the

existing dwelling; a less bulky chalet style building would allow for the required additional living space but would be less visually intrusive and more appropriate given the scale of the existing bungalow. This would also be more in keeping with the character and appearance of the locality. An application was then submitted on this basis. This alternative proposal for a 1 ½ storey dwelling would have a slightly larger footprint than the dwelling it seeks to replace and with living accommodation within the roof space. Considering permitted development rights and the potential for the existing bungalow to be appropriately extended this was considered acceptable and in accordance with policy DM5. The application was considered by the Delegation Panel and approved.

20. The proposed cartlodge, would be a substantial outbuilding but its impact is lessened due to the hipped roof with low eaves. It is of a traditional appearance for an outbuilding and whilst the footprint is sizeable, the accommodation it provides is not unreasonable to serve a small holding of this size. There are therefore no concerns with this element of the proposal within the application.

Impact on Protected Species

21. The Ecology, Tree and Landscape Officer has reviewed the submitted survey information. The Greenlight report dated 15th May stated a low level of bat activity on the site and there was no evidence to show bats were using the existing bungalow. Bat boxes are proposed on the replacement dwelling and a condition could secure an appropriate bat mitigation strategy.

Conclusion:

22. In conclusion, planning permission has already been granted for a more appropriate one and a half storey dwelling. This application for a two storey dwelling cannot be supported for the reasons detailed in the report above and as set out in the recommendation below.

Recommendation:

23. It is recommended that planning permission be **REFUSED** for the following reason:
1. The site is situated in a relatively isolated location in the countryside outside of any designated housing settlement boundaries. The proposed two-storey replacement dwelling would be more than double the floor area and scale of the existing dwelling and therefore fails to respect the scale of the dwelling it seeks to replace. The proposal is therefore contrary to policy DM5 of the adopted Joint Development Management Policies Document.

Documents:

All background documents including application forms, drawings and other supporting documentation relating to this application can be viewed online:

<https://planning.westsuffolk.gov.uk/online-applications/applicationDetails.do?activeTab=documents&keyVal=NNGF2XPDHW100>